

Bradley A. Benbrook (SBN 177786)  
Benbrook Law Group  
400 Capitol Mall, Ste 2530  
Sacramento, CA 95814  
Tel: (916) 447-4900  
Fax: (916) 447-4904  
Email: brad@benbrooklawgroup.com  
*Counsel for Intervening States*

PATRICK MORRISEY  
*West Virginia Attorney General*  
Lindsay S. See  
*Solicitor General*  
Thomas T. Lampman  
*Assistant Solicitor General*  
West Virginia Office of the Attorney General  
1900 Kanawha Blvd. East  
Building 1, Room E-26  
Tel: (304) 558-2021  
Fax: (304) 558-0140  
Email: lindsay.s.see@wvago.gov  
*Counsel for Intervenor State of West Virginia*

CHRISTOPHER M. CARR  
*Attorney General of Georgia*  
Andrew A. Pinson  
*Solicitor General*  
Drew F. Waldbeser  
*Assistant Solicitor General*  
Office of the Georgia Attorney General  
40 Capitol Square, S.W.  
Atlanta, Georgia 30334  
Tel: (404) 458-3409  
Fax: (404) 656-2199  
Email: apinson@law.ga.gov  
*Counsel for Intervenor State of Georgia*

(Add'l Counsel Listed on Signature Page)

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA**

State of California, *et al.*,  
*Plaintiffs,*  
v.  
Michael Regan, *et al.*,  
*Defendants.*

Case No. 3:20-cv-3005-RS

**STATE INTERVENORS'  
OPPOSITION TO DEFENDANTS'  
MOTION TO CONTINUE STAY**

Action Filed: May 1, 2020

1       The State Intervenor-Defendants oppose the Agencies’ motion to continue the stay of these  
 2 proceedings, *see* ECF No. 237, for substantially the same reasons that warranted denying the stay  
 3 in the first place, *see* ECF No. 223. Speculation about future rulemaking ordinarily does not  
 4 justify staying a legal challenge to a currently effective rule. *See, e.g., Arizona Yage Assembly v.*  
 5 *Barr*, No. 3:20-CV-03098-WHO, 2020 WL 5629833, at \*8 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 21, 2020) (refusing  
 6 to grant a stay even after new rulemaking began because “it is impossible to predict when the  
 7 regulations will be finalized”); *California v. U.S. EPA*, 360 F. Supp. 3d 984, 993 (N.D. Cal. 2018)  
 8 (denying a stay despite the EPA actively preparing a new rule because of “the ordinary  
 9 uncertainty in the rulemaking process, which creates at least a ‘fair possibility’ of harm”). Much  
 10 less is a stay justified based on a hypothetical future rulemaking process that the Agencies  
 11 themselves acknowledge may never occur. ECF No. 237, at 4 (explaining that the  
 12 Administrator’s review could result in the NWPR being “maintained”).

13       The Agencies now assert that continuing that stay will “allow time for the new  
 14 Administrator to consider options and make an informed decision regarding which direction it  
 15 will take with respect to the Rule.” *Id.* at 3–4. But that review can occur at any time, with or  
 16 without a stay. *Id.* at 4 (explaining that “Agencies have inherent authority to review past  
 17 decisions and to revise, replace, or repeal a decision” (citing *FCC v. Fox Television Stations, Inc.*,  
 18 556 U.S. 502, 515 (2009))). The Agencies do not explain how continuing the stay in this  
 19 litigation would actually aid or allow for this ongoing review of apparently indefinite duration.  
 20 On the other hand, resolving this lawsuit on the merits would provide clarity on the legal bounds  
 21 of the Agencies’ authority, *see* ECF No. 223, at 4, which *would* undoubtedly aid the Agencies in  
 22 their consideration of any future rulemaking. Because the Agencies have not made anything  
 23 approaching a “clear case of hardship or inequity in being required to go forward,” *California v.*  
 24 *EPA*, 360 F. Supp. 3d at 993 (quoting *Landis v. North American Co.*, 299 U.S. 248, 255 (1936)),  
 25 and continuing the stay indefinitely will further prolong the legal uncertainty about the scope of  
 26 the Agencies’ jurisdiction, this Court should deny their motion to continue the stay.

1 Respectfully submitted.

2 /s/ Bradley A. Benbrook  
 3 Bradley A. Benbrook  
 4 Benbrook Law Group  
 400 Capitol Mall, Ste 2530  
 Sacramento, CA 95814  
 Tel: (916) 447-4900  
 Fax: (916) 447-4904  
 Email: ben@benbrooklawgroup.com  
 6 *Counsel for Intervening States*

7  
 8 PATRICK MORRISEY  
*West Virginia Attorney General*

9 /s/ Lindsay S. See  
 10 Lindsay S. See  
*Solicitor General*  
 Thomas T. Lampman  
*Assistant Solicitor General*  
 West Virginia Office of the Attorney General  
 12 1900 Kanawha Blvd. East  
 Building 1, Room E-26  
 13 Tel: (304) 558-2021  
 Fax: (304) 558-0140  
 Email: lindsay.s.see@wvago.gov  
 14 *Counsel for Intervenor State of West Virginia*

15  
 16 TREG R. TAYLOR  
*Attorney General of Alaska*

17 /s/ Jennifer Currie  
 18 Jennifer Currie  
*Senior Assistant Attorney General*  
 Alaska Department of Law  
 19 1031 West 4th Avenue, Suite 200  
 Anchorage, AK 99501-1994  
 20 Tel: (907) 269-5100  
 Fax: (907) 276-3697  
 Email: attorney.general@alaska.gov  
 21 *Counsel for Intervenor State of Alaska*

22  
 23 LAWRENCE WASDEN  
*Attorney General of Idaho*

24 /s/ Mark Cecchini-Beaver  
 25 Mark Cecchini-Beaver  
*Deputy Attorney General*  
 Office of the Attorney General  
 Environmental Quality Section  
 26 1410 N. Hilton, 2nd Floor  
 Boise, ID 83706  
 27 Tel: (208) 373-0494  
 28

CHRISTOPHER M. CARR  
*Attorney General of Georgia*

/s/ Andrew A. Pinson  
 Andrew A. Pinson  
*Solicitor General*  
 Drew F. Waldbeser  
*Assistant Solicitor General*  
 Office of the Attorney General  
 40 Capitol Square, S.W.  
 Atlanta, Georgia 30334  
 Tel: (404) 651-9453  
 Fax: (404) 656-2199  
 Email: apinson@law.ga.gov  
*Counsel for Intervenor State of Georgia*

STEVE MARSHALL  
*Attorney General of Alabama*

/s/ A Barrett Bowdre  
 A. Barrett Bowdre\*  
*Deputy Solicitor General*  
 Office of the Attorney General  
 501 Washington Ave.  
 P.O. Box 300152  
 Montgomery, AL 36130  
 Telephone: (334) 353-8892  
 Fax: (334) 353-8400  
 Email: barrett.bowdre@AlabamaAG.gov  
*Counsel for Intervenor State of Alabama*

LESLIE RUTLEDGE  
*Attorney General of Arkansas*  
 Nicholas J. Bronni  
*Solicitor General*  
 Vincent M. Wagner  
*Deputy Solicitor General*

/s/ Dylan L. Jacobs  
 Dylan L. Jacobs  
*Assistant Solicitor General*  
 Office of the Attorney General  
 323 Center St., Suite 200  
 Little Rock, AR 72201  
 Tel: (501) 682-3661  
 Fax: (501) 682-2591  
 Email: Dylan.Jacobs@ArkansasAG.gov  
*Counsel for Intervenor State of Arkansas*

THEODORE E. ROKITA  
*Attorney General of Indiana*

Fax: (208) 373-0481  
 Email: Mark.Cecchini-Beaver@deq.idaho.gov  
*Counsel for Intervenor State of Idaho*

DEREK SCHMIDT  
*Attorney General of Kansas*

/s/ Jeffrey A. Chanay  
 Jeffrey A. Chanay  
*Chief Deputy Attorney General*  
 Office of the Attorney General  
 120 SW 10th Ave., 3rd Floor  
 Topeka, Kansas 66612  
 Tel: (785) 368-8435  
 Email: jeff.chanay@ag.ks.gov  
*Counsel for Intervenor State of Kansas*

JEFF LANDRY  
*Attorney General of Louisiana*

/s/ Elizabeth B. Murrill  
 Elizabeth B. Murrill  
*Solicitor General*  
 Joseph Scott St. John  
*Deputy Attorney General*  
 Louisiana Department of Justice  
 1885 N. 3rd St.  
 Baton Rouge, LA 70802  
 Tel: (225) 456-7544  
 Email: MurrillE@ag.louisiana.gov  
*Counsel for Intervenor State of Louisiana*

ERIC S. SCHMITT  
*Attorney General of Missouri*

/s/ Julie Marie Blake  
 Julie Marie Blake  
*Deputy Solicitor General*  
 Office of the Attorney General  
 P.O. Box 899  
 Jefferson City, MO 65102  
 Tel: (573) 751-3321  
 Fax: (573) 751-0774  
 Email: Julie.Blake@ago.mo.gov  
*Counsel for Intervenor State of Missouri*

DOUGLAS J. PETERSON  
*Attorney General*

/s/ James A. Campbell  
 James A. Campbell  
*Solicitor General*

/s/ Thomas M. Fisher  
 Thomas M. Fisher  
*Solicitor General of Indiana*  
 Office of the Indiana Attorney General  
 302 W. Washington Street, IGCS, 5<sup>th</sup> Floor  
 Indianapolis, Indiana  
 Tel: (317) 233-8292  
 Fax: (317) 233-8292  
 Email: tom.fisher@atg.in.gov  
*Counsel for Intervenor State of Indiana*

DANIEL CAMERON  
*Attorney General of Kentucky*

/s/ Carmine G. Iaccarino  
 Carmine G. Iaccarino  
*Executive Director, Office of Civil & Environmental Law*  
 Office of the Attorney General  
 700 Capitol Avenue  
 Frankfort, Kentucky 40601  
 Tel: (502) 696-5650  
 Email: Carmine.Iaccarino@ky.gov  
*Counsel for Intervenor Commonwealth of Kentucky*

LYNN FITCH  
*Attorney General of Mississippi*

/s/ Scott Stewart  
 Scott Stewart  
*Solicitor General*  
 Office of the Attorney General  
 P.O. Box 220  
 Jackson, Mississippi 39205  
 Tel: (601) 359-5563  
 Email: Scott.Stewart@ago.ms.gov  
*Counsel for Intervenor State of Mississippi*  
*Application for Admission Pro Hac Vice*  
*Forthcoming*

AUSTIN KNUDSEN  
*Attorney General of Montana*

/s/David M.S. Dewhirst  
 David M.S. Dewhirst  
*Solicitor General*  
 Office of the Attorney General  
 215 North Sanders / P.O. Box 201401  
 Helena, MT 59620-1401  
 Tel: (406) 444-3602  
 Email: david.dewhirst@mt.gov

Justin D. Lavene  
Assistant Attorney General  
Office of the Nebraska Attorney General  
2115 State Capitol  
Lincoln, NE 68509  
Email: justin.lavene@nebraska.gov  
Email: jim.campbell@nebraska.gov  
Tel: (402) 471-2682  
*Counsel for Intervenor State of Nebraska*

DAVE YOST  
*Attorney General of Ohio*

/s/ Benjamin M. Flowers  
Benjamin M. Flowers  
*Solicitor General*  
Office of Ohio Attorney General  
30 E. Broad St., 17th Floor  
Columbus, OH 43215  
Tel: (614) 728-7511  
Email: bflowers@ohioattorneygeneral.gov  
*Counsel for Intervenor State of Ohio*

ALAN WILSON  
*Attorney General*

/s/ James Emory Smith, Jr.  
James Emory Smith, Jr.  
*Deputy Solicitor General*  
Office of the Attorney General  
1000 Assembly Street, Room 519  
Columbia, South Carolina 29201  
Tel: (803) 734-3680  
Email: esmith@scag.gov  
*Counsel for Intervenor State of South Carolina*

HERBERT H. SLATERY, III  
*Attorney General and Reporter of Tennessee*  
Andrée S. Blumstein  
*Solicitor General*  
Sarah K. Campbell  
*Associate Solicitor General*

/s/ Elizabeth P. McCarter  
Elizabeth P. McCarter  
*Senior Assistant Attorney General*  
Office of the Attorney General  
P.O. Box 20207  
Nashville, TN 37202  
Tel: (515) 532-2582  
Email: lisa.mccarter@ag.tn.gov

*Counsel for Intervenor State of Montana*

WAYNE STENEHJEM  
*Attorney General of North Dakota*  
/s/ Margaret I. Olson  
Margaret I. Olson  
*Assistant Attorney General*  
North Dakota Office of Attorney General  
500 N. 9th Street  
Bismarck, ND 58501  
Tel: (701) 328-3640  
Fax: (701) 328-4300  
Email: maiolson@nd.gov  
*Counsel for Intervenor State of North Dakota*

MIKE HUNTER  
*Attorney General of Oklahoma*

/s/ Mithun Mansinghani  
Mithun Mansinghani  
*Solicitor General*  
Oklahoma Office of the Attorney General  
313 NE 21st Street  
Oklahoma City, OK 73105  
Tel: (405) 522-4392  
Email: Mithun.Mansinghani@aog.ok.gov  
*Counsel for Intervenor State of Oklahoma*

JASON R. RAVNSBORG  
*Attorney General*

/s/ Ann F. Mines Bailey  
Ann F. Mines Bailey  
*Assistant Attorney General*  
State of South Dakota  
1302 E. Highway 14, Suite 1  
Pierre, SD 57501-8501  
Tel: (605) 773-3215  
Fax: (605) 773-4106  
Email: ann.mines@state.sd.us  
*Counsel for Intervenor State of South Dakota*

KEN PAXTON  
*Attorney General of Texas*

/s/ Judd E. Stone II  
Judd E. Stone II  
*Solicitor General*  
Office of the Attorney General  
P.O. Box 12548  
Austin, TX 78711-2548

*Counsel for Intervenor State of Tennessee*

SEAN D. REYES

*Attorney General of Utah*

/s/ Daniel Burton

Daniel Burton

*Chief Policy Counsel*

Office of the Attorney General

Utah State Capitol Complex

350 North State Street, Suite 230

Salt Lake City, Utah 84114-2320

Tel: (801) 538-9600

Email: danburton@agutah.gov

*Counsel for Intervenor State of Utah*

Tel: (512) 936-1700

Fax: (512) 474-2697

Email: Kyle.Hawkins@oag.texas.gov

*Counsel for Intervenor State of Texas*

BRIDGET HILL

*Attorney General of Wyoming*

/s/ James C. Kaste

James C. Kaste

*Deputy Attorney General*

Office of the Attorney General

2320 Capitol Avenue

Cheyenne, WY 82002

Tel: (307) 777-6946

Fax: (307) 777-3542

Email: james.kaste@wyo.gov

*Counsel for Intervenor State of Wyoming*

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that on April 15, 2021, I served this opposition to plaintiffs' motion for a preliminary injunction and cross-motion for summary judgment by filing it with this Court's ECF system.

/s/ Andrew A. Pinson  
Andrew A. Pinson